



56, rue de Passy – 75016 Paris–France – Tel : (33) 1.42.24.51.48 – Fax: (33) 1.42.24.86.33 – Email : helio@helio-international.org

Evaluation of the CLACC Programme

***Final Report
2009***

March 2010

***By
Rod Janssen
HELIO International***

Table of Contents

		Page
1	Introduction	4
2	From the 2008 Evaluation	4
3	The Evaluation Process	5
4	CLACC	6
5	Major Findings	8
6	CLACC Beyond 2009	19
7	Conclusions and Recommendations	19
Annexes		
1	The 2009 CLACC Team	21
2	Calendar of Events in December during the COP 15 and CCG Participation	22

Main Acronyms

CAN	Climate Action Network
CBA	Community-Based Adaptation
CBAA	Community-Based Adaptation in Africa
CLACC	Capacity Strengthening of Civil Society in the Least Developed Countries (LDCs) for Adaptation to Climate Change
IDRC	International Development Research Centre, in Canada
IIED	International Institute for Environment and Development
LDCs	Least Developed Countries
LSHTM	London School of Hygiene and Tropical Medicine
NAPA	National Adaptation Programmes of Action
RING	Regional and International Networking Group
SEI	Stockholm Environment Institute

2009 Evaluation of the CLACC Programme

1. Introduction

The Capacity Strengthening of Civil Society in the Least Developed Countries (LDCs) for Adaptation to Climate Change – the CLACC programme – began in 2004 as an initiative of the Regional and International Networking Group (RING). It was created to address concerns that LDCs were ill-equipped to address the growing issue of adaptation within the climate change field. LDCs are amongst the most vulnerable countries. CLACC was created to help strengthen the capacity of civil society in a limited number of LDCs in Africa and South Asia. The main component of CLACC is its fellowships that bring individuals from partner organisations in LDCs into an on-going process of capacity building.

CLACC is managed by IIED on behalf of the group. CLACC operates in 15 countries: 12 in Africa and 3 in South Asia. CLACC is divided into four regions: South Asia, West Africa, East Africa and Southern Africa. While CLACC is for LDCs, each region is headed by a Regional partner, which is a member of RING. The regional partners play an important co-ordination and management role for the CLACC Fellows. The three LDCs in west Africa are francophone.

The Climate Change Programme at IIED spearheads the CLACC programme, giving it the management and reporting structure, undertaking to obtain funding, providing the activity, intellectual and policy guidance.

IIED is supported by other partner organisations that provide guidance and leadership on specific topics. Partner organisations include the Stockholm Environment Institute and the London School of Hygiene and Tropical Medicine.

CLACC Fellows do not work in isolation in their own countries. There are many opportunities for them to work together to share experiences, particularly at the annual COPs. They also work more closely together at the regional level.

As these Fellows evolve in this process, the CLACC programme adds new activities to their responsibilities. These activities are directed towards the overarching objective of strengthening the capacity within civil society of the LDCs involved.

This is the final year of a three-year monitoring of CLACC. The evaluator has already prepared a report

2. From the 2008 Evaluation

From the 2008 evaluation:

The basic conclusion is that CLACC is special. It has created its own culture, its own style of working. Saleemul Huq is a real mentor for them and everyone knows this will evolve as his role changes within IIED. And CLACC is a core activity of IIED. This is evident by even reviewing the IIED website.

Thus, the impact will be in outreach and broadening the base of those individuals and organisations who have gained in experience and capacity. While the results are good, they can improve. . . . Adaptation as a climate change policy area will only grow in importance. And once adequate funding is in place, there will be considerable

pressure to deliver results. And there will be a need for more individuals and organisations to play a role in policy and in programme development – locally, regionally and internationally. . . . And it is encouraging that former Fellows take their gained experience into new roles. This has a valuable multiplier effect. Overall, it is a daunting but exciting challenge.

The main recommendations for the CLACC programme are:

- There is a need for a long term vision and commitment by IIED management in order to allow CLACC Fellows and their organisations to establish and maintain their visibility and their credibility within their national civil society;
- There is a need to ensure that all CLACC organisations are fully supportive of the CLACC activities and of the CLACC Fellow;
- There is a need for Fellows to complete annual reports in a timely fashion; these reports are important for overall CLACC management as well as for their own organisations;
- There is a need to develop and/or more material that is suitable for a French speaking audience and it may be of benefit to have a small section (maybe not all) of the website in French;
- There is a need for project leaders from IIED to recognise the pace of project development that is realistic, given the constraints that many Fellows have within their own organisations;
- CLACC objectives should reviewed on a regular basis to ensure that they reflect the actual objectives that are understood by all participants; and
- Dissemination, stakeholder involvement and awareness creation of CLACC results, such as the health study, must be an on-going activity.

3. The Evaluation Process

Rod Janssen of HELIO International heads the evaluation process. This is the first of a three-year monitoring and evaluation exercise. Rod Janssen works with a team of in-country monitors. These monitors are primarily for the LDC countries and not for the regional co-ordinators¹.

This evaluation covers the calendar year 2009, essentially from COP 14 in Poznan to COP 15 in Copenhagen

According to the terms of reference, the evaluation is undertaken by:

1. Evaluation of Programme management:

- By reading all documentation produced over the year) including monitoring reports).
- By meeting with and interacting with IIED during the year
- By talking to other members of the CLACC management team.
- By getting feedback from CLACC Fellows and other partners

2. Evaluation of in-country outcomes of CLACC partners:

- By engaging an in-country “monitor” in each CLACC country
- By asking the in-country monitor to provide an annual report on levels of awareness of climate change issues in each country as well as the activities of the CLACC partner

¹ HELIO has monitors in the regional countries of Bangladesh and Kenya.

- By talking to in-country monitors whenever necessary by phone.

3. Evaluation of individual CLACC Fellows:

- By reading all reports provided by each individual CLACC Fellow during the year
- By meeting and talking to each CLACC Fellow (primarily at the COP)

4. Results from meeting CLACC Team:

- By attending the annual CLACC Team meeting at the COP each year.

Rod Janssen attended the CLACC team meeting at COP 15 in Copenhagen, attended many of the daily CLACC de-briefings and met individually with the CLACC Fellows. Mr. Janssen has regular discussions with IIED staff as well as others involved with different aspects of CLACC on an on-going basis.

The in-country monitors were tasked to monitor specific deliverables expected from the Fellows and also to get a sense of how adaptation is being given priority in the specific country. These monitors are under the supervision of Rod Janssen of HELIO International and are completely independent of CLACC. This is a requirement of HELIO, since it provide an independent monitoring service for many projects. All of the monitors have a background in environmental issues, although not necessarily as adaptation specialists. Monitoring reports are provided in an annex to this report. Monitors were given a fairly free hand to monitor how the Fellow was working in the country and how the objectives of CLACC were being met.

4. CLACC

CLACC – Capacity Strengthening of Civil Society in the Least Developed Countries (LDCs) for Adaptation to Climate Change – is sometimes called a project, sometimes an initiative. It brings together northern partners with those in 15 LDC and poor countries.

CLACC started in 2004 as an initiative of RING² and involved RING partners who were in the main LDC-relevant regions (i.e. ACTS in Kenya, BCAS in Bangladesh, ENDA in Senegal and ZERO in Zimbabwe) plus IIED (that co-ordinates RING climate change activities) and the Stockholm Environment Institute (SEI). The London School of Hygiene and Tropical Medicine (LSHTM) is also a northern partner. CLACC is managed by IIED on behalf of the group.

The stated objectives of CLACC are to:

- Strengthen the capacity of civil society in LDCs to adapt to climate change creating greater adaptive capacity among the most vulnerable groups;
- Establish an information and knowledge system catering to countries dealing with the adverse impacts of climate change; and
- Mainstream the NAPA process with key non-governmental stakeholders.

CLACC supports LDCs to adapt to climate change. Because their degree of vulnerability is high, the programmes in LDCs require long-term capacity strengthening within governments as well as civil society.

The CLACC project works through four regional partners in South Asia (BCAS) East Africa (ACTS), West Africa (ENDA) and Southern Africa (ZERO). They are all members of the RING Alliance. CLACC focused

² The RING is an alliance of organisations (which includes from the north IIED, SEI and IISD). See: www.ring-alliance.org.

on these regions because they include the communities that will be disproportionately and negatively affected by climate change. Within those four regions, a total of 15 countries participate. Beside the four regional partners, there are individual partner organisations in the other countries.³

A range of initiatives is undertaken through CLACC to meet the objectives. These are undertaken through the partner organisations in the 15 countries where there are specific people who have become "CLACC Fellows."

The work programme for 2009 provided individual country tasks that were agreed upon through formalised grant agreements. There was core work common to all. Certain organisations, mainly regional fellows, had extra tasks.

The core work included:

- Organise a national workshop for 20-30 NGOs to discuss climate change and feedback the results of COP14 in Poznan, explaining what this means to NGOs and other organisations and describing how they can get more involved in the build up to COP15. The UNFCCC focal point and, where appropriate, Adaptation Fund Board members should be invited to this meeting.
- Hold regular meetings after this post-COP14 meeting to continue the work of the Forum throughout 2009. This may involve awareness-raising activities with local NGOs with little knowledge of climate change.
- Encourage NGO members to subscribe to *Tiempo*.
- Develop a strategy to work with national media to raise awareness about climate change issues by increasing the press coverage and attention accorded to these issues.

Most also had to produce a workshop report after the first task and disseminate it to national government officials and NGOs.

Some had to:

- Bangladesh: Establish a listserve for NGOs and individuals interested in climate change and development issues in Bangladesh
- Kenya: Develop the work of the policy and media sub-groups of the Kenya Climate Change Forum.
- Kenya: Attend the national workshops organised by CLACC fellows in Tanzania, Uganda and Sudan, help with organising these workshops and writing the reports.
- Kenya: Set up a video conferencing system, compatible with IIED's own system and those of other regional CLACC fellows, to support low-carbon communication between CLACC partners.
- Mozambique: Get assistance from the regional CLACC fellow with organising the meeting and writing the report. Regional CLACC fellows have funding to allow them to attend the workshop and support you in this work.
- Nepal: Providing support to the NAPA formulation process.
- Senegal: Attend the national workshops organised by CLACC fellows in Mali, Mauritania and Benin, help with organising these workshops and writing the reports.
- Senegal: Set up a video conferencing system, compatible with IIED's own system and those of other regional CLACC fellows, to support low-carbon communication between CLACC partners.
- Tanzania: Link in with the existing Pan African Group looking at climate change, and other pre-existing coalitions so activities are complementary. Likewise, co-ordinate activities with existing events such as the Environment Week/Day in Tanzania.
- Zimbabwe: Attend the national workshops organised by CLACC fellows in Mozambique, Zambia and Malawi, help with organising these workshops and writing the reports.

³ In Bangladesh, BCAS is the regional partner but there is also a country partner, Caritas, that acts in a similar fashion to the other (non-regional) country partners.

- Zimbabwe: Exploring novel ways to share information. For example through a quarterly newsletter for CSOs working on development and climate change issues, and video documentation of climate change by CSOs and government officials.
- Zimbabwe: Set up a video conferencing system, compatible with IIED's own system and those of other regional CLACC fellows, to support low-carbon communication between CLACC partners.

Governance and Management

As stated above, CLACC is managed for the RING Alliance by IIED. The work programme was initially set by Dr. Huq at the beginning of the programme, although it became a team effort as the IIED climate change group evolved and Saleem was replaced as head of the group. Other groups within IIED also get involved. This includes the Human Settlements and Sustainable Markets Groups, in particular. The work programme is developed through discussions with partner organisations and through discussions with donors. Work is monitored by IIED through regular contacts, overseeing the deliverables and having Fellows prepare annual reports and reports after the COP meetings.

The RING Alliance is kept informed on the implementation status.

Governance is also supported by the role of the Regional Fellows, who play a role in supporting the activities of the CLACC Fellows.

5. Major Findings

Overall Performance

The overall performance includes finalising some of the previous work from 2008 and the tasks given to the Fellows in 2009. It also includes some of the projects that have continued into 2009 and that have had an important impact on CLACC.

There were some changes in fellows with several changing organisations, thus bringing in new people. One would have thought this would have held back progress but this overall was not the case. New fellows by and large fit in very well. There was one concern in Mali where the new fellow had a poor command of English. The monitor stated that "this poses some difficulties to understand most of the documents, which are in English. The language barrier also limit the communication between the CLACC fellow and IIED for effective management of the CLACC programme in Mali." However, the CLACC Fellow was also supported by the regional Fellow, so the overall concern was minimised.⁴

⁴ The Regional Fellow from Senegal stated to the evaluator: "Although they do not work in French, I think that IIED do have a reflex in French. To confirm that we just need to have a look on West Africa CLACC countries: they are all francophone countries! IIED could have opted to work with Ghana, Nigeria or Sierra Leone instead of francophone countries with which they are hardly able to communicate! But today and thanks to IIED, West Africa CLACC fellows have a good English level so that they can easily communicate and work with IIED as well as express themselves at international forums where English is a dominating language. I should say that if I was not CLACC fellow with IIED, maybe I wouldn't have been able to write you this message in fairly good English. IIED has so recognised that in the current climate change debate the francophone audience is left behind, that they supported a French version of the so called Tiempo publication. Now, francophone people can read Tiempo and can even submit French articles for publication in Tiempo." Correspondence with Mamouda Moussa Na Abou, February 8, 2010.

In 2009 all CLACC fellows were very active in mobilising NGOs in their country. There were important follow-ups following COP 14. These were for awareness creation and in some cases for capacity building. It can be generally said that all of them were very active. All were motivated because 2009 was a continuous lead up to the crucial COP15 in Copenhagen when a blueprint for the future was to be decided upon.

There were generally regular meetings held throughout the year in preparation for Copenhagen. For example, in Mali there were nine separate NGO contact meetings throughout the year.

From Uganda

The CLACC Fellow [in Uganda] organised two climate hearing activities in Kasubi – Kampala and Gogonyo – Pallisa. These public dialogues attracted more than 250 people who shared their experiences of the impact of climate change and what is needed to address it.

Monitor in Uganda

From Kenya

Most of the activities for the year were geared towards improving existing networks such as the Kenya Climate Change Forum (KCF) and National Climate Change Consortium of Kenya (NCCCK) which bring together non-governmental organizations working on environmental and development issues and other representatives of civil society working on coping with the impacts of current climate variability and finding lasting solutions to the threats of future climate change.

Kenya, like many other developing countries, is faced with the challenge of poor coordination of climate change activities. Networking [by the CLACC Fellow] among civil society organizations, government officials and communities has helped create awareness and exchange information.

Monitor in Kenya

Almost all fellows attended Copenhagen. All of those attended performed extremely well. Most have provided reports on their activities. Importantly, they were active with their delegations. Delegations were expanded in 2009 to cope with the increased activity in expectation of a breakthrough and in many cases the CLACC Fellow was used as a resource on both climate change science and policy as well as on UN process, since many had attended several COPs. Sumaya Zaki Eldeen, the Fellow from Sudan, was on her country delegation as it headed the G77. The delegation also had expanded to 30 people and Sumaya was looked upon as a valuable resource.

The major contribution that I made to my country was not at the COP but prior meetings held in consultation with the delegation before the meeting. CLACC under ACTS was involved in most meetings at the state level. We were overwhelmed at the number of sessions we were to attend to share our experience in negotiations as well as what needed to be prioritised in terms of adaptation and the policy implications. Many years past, ACTS in partnership with IIED had a project which involved strengthening the African capacity in the negotiations. Over the years the state has always reached out for our support in this kind of endeavour. The CLACC fellow has always been seen as playing the role of “intelligence” and different stakeholders in the country look out for them for an update in climate science field and what is happening at the global level.

...

The efforts made by IIED were commendable. As an observer institution it did a commendable job. The Development and Climate days was a plus. It gave an opportunity for people to showcase what climate science is all about not only in theory but in practise as well.

Message by Elvin Nyukuri, Regional Fellow, Kenya

As a team, it was indeed one of the best COP participation we have ever had over the years but in terms of negotiations nothing dynamic has been contributed by our group so far. I have had the privilege to discuss this with my delegates several times over the two week period and at least I am content to receive the acknowledgement of the minister our role as an NGO and CLACCC fellow.

Dago Tschering, Fellow, Bhutan

At Copenhagen, all worked closely with Mike Shanahan to make contacts with media from their countries.

From Mike Shanahan, IIED

Overall I would say that the CLACC fellows did a good job in Copenhagen of connecting up with media from their countries who were there. They are such a diverse group with so many other responsibilities that we could never expect them all to do great and go much further. Some are naturally into communications and see what the media offers, others are less so and I so they give media work a lower level of priority.

Before COP15 I sent each CLACC fellow a list of our media contacts in their country so they have a list in addition to any existing contacts. For some (e.g. Kenya, Uganda, Bangladesh) this was a pretty long list, but for those in Francophone Africa our lists are very short.

During COP15 most if not all of the CLACC fellows met with journalists from their countries, and in some cases they met regularly to brief the journalists and help with introductions to delegations.

In Copenhagen four of the CLACC fellows volunteered to do a tailored press release for media back home. We developed a single press release and added in country-specific info and quotes from the relevant CLACC fellow. I then sent the press release to our media contacts in each country (Tanzania, Uganda and Zimbabwe) though we don't know what the uptake was as most media there do not have online versions that are easy to track.

Meeting with Tanzanian Minister, Dr Batlida

This meeting with Dr Batlida was an opportunity for us to discuss about the progress of the negotiations and how can government and NGOs network collaborate to reach the target of facilitating adaptation and mitigation in our countries. She shared with us the position of the country and the fact that the outcome of the negotiations should assist Tanzania on its efforts to develop.

The Minister shared with us her key expectations for Copenhagen which were outcome which is not for profit but the right one for poor and vulnerable people and the need to keep the Kyoto Protocol because it is the only legally binding international framework to respond to global warming and climate change threats.

Euster Kibona, Fellow, Tanzania

Some of the other tasks of CLACC Fellows is to attend the COP, interact with their delegations, attend certain functions such as Climate Action Network (CAN) International meetings (as well as regional CAN meetings), follow negotiations and attend events that have special interest to them, their organisation and their country. Most of them were involved in the Development and Energy Days organised by IIED.

There was a noticeable change in the motivation of the fellows this year, in part because of the stakes involved in the conference. Several fellows were playing increasingly important roles for the delegations, sometimes being made part of the delegation. This was brought about in large part because some delegations were larger and less experienced and the CLACC fellow was often much more knowledgeable about the issues and the process than their government counterparts.

CLACC fellows were active with the media as mentioned by Mike Shanahan, some even being interviewed for the Comic Relief website. Many wrote opinion pieces to be distributed to their national press. Many worked closely with journalists who were part of the Climate Change Media Partnership co-sponsored by IIED, particularly those from their own country.

Concerning dissemination of results and general awareness about CLACC and its workings, the website and newsletter have been invaluable. They do, however, from time to time suffer from the lack of timely updating (especially in the case of the website). For example, the most recent newsletter from December 2009 is not on the site. The last two newsletters, that are relevant to work in 2009, were excellent.

At the beginning of the CLACC programme, Fellows were required to create libraries that would be resource centres for information on climate change and adaptation. These would be made available to a wide audience. Much of the material for these libraries came from IIED or obtained from other organisations while attending such events such as COPs. These libraries overall have developed well (see below under Impact for example from Nepal).

Some other examples of CLACC initiatives are provided in the separate evaluation of IIED at COP 15 prepared by the author.

There has been follow up work on previous projects. The main ones were the health studies and the city studies. For the health studies, there were eight country reports (for West Africa it covered the three regional countries) published in 2008. The Bangladesh study was completed but never uploaded to the CLACC website. In 2009 there was a special *Tiempo* edition on health and adaptation, with three country reports and two synthesis reports. Monitor reports in 2009 express very little on any continuing awareness creation on health aspects of climate change.

The other major area that continued to have attention in 2009 was the work being undertaken on cities. This is led by David Dodman of the Human Settlements Group of IIED. There are three city studies on the CLACC website (Harare, Dar Es Salaam, Khulna City in Bangladesh, plus a presentation on Senegal from Poznan). Recently, IIED published a brochure on the subject, Climate change and the urban poor. Risk and resilience in 15 of the world's most vulnerable cities, which is available on the IIED website. This brochure highlights the work that was undertaken by the CLACC Fellows in previous years. David Dodman believes that the Fellows are now much better equipped to continue work in urban issues related to adaptation if they so wish. At least work will continue in two countries, Zimbabwe and Tanzania. David will continue working with several of the Fellows.

IIED is also working on a project on Climate Change Economics with several CLACC Fellows. This is led by Muyeye Chambwera of the Sustainable Markets Group of IIED. This is not specifically on the 2009 work programme of CLACC but it is work that has been evolving for some time. The first phase came to an end in March, and we are pursuing a second phase that will do some field studies in project areas.

CLACC Fellows were actively involved in: (1) selecting and orientating economists (economists from 3 countries were from CLACC organizations); (2) facilitating local consultative meetings and introducing economists to local climate change processes.

A project brief for the first phase has been prepared and will soon be published by IIED. IIED is now following up that phase with specific research in Malawi, Bangladesh and Sudan. Data collection is currently underway and a project brochure will soon be available from IIED. In February 2010 at the Community Based Adaptation conference in Tanzania, two CLACC Fellows from Malawi and Bangladesh made presentations in the economics session of economic issues arising from their case studies.

Under CLACC programme a first phase of a study on economics of adaptation was conducted. A special meeting was organised for the forum in order to disseminate the findings of the study. The audience were quite interested and raise a lot questions.

Sumaya Zaki Eldeen, Fellow, Sudan

Many of the CLACC Fellows in Africa are involved in the Community Based Adaptation to Climate Change in Africa (CBAA) project funded by IDRC. The objective is to help communities in the participating countries, adapt to climate change and share lessons learned from project activities with key stakeholders at local, national, regional and international levels, to elicit their support for climate change adaptation. Specific objectives include: Test the efficacy of Local Options for Communities to Adapt and Technologies to Enhance Capacity (LOCATE) methodology; Develop a tried and tested methodology for setting baselines, monitoring and evaluating changes in climate adaptation capacity; and Reduce the vulnerability and enhance the capacity to adapt to climate change of particularly vulnerable communities in 8 African countries. More information is available at www.cbaafrica.org.

Overall, CLACC Fellows have become much more effective over the past three years. This was most evident at COP 15. The Fellows were organised, active, motivated and professional. They were more confident. They were thorough working with delegations, other organisations, the media, IIED staff and amongst themselves. Some contributed information to the team on the status of negotiations. They were totally committed. They were as active at the first team meeting at 8 a.m. as they were at the last team meeting at 10 p.m.

At the annual CLACC meeting held during COP 15, all the Fellows showed a strong commitment to remain together as a programme and as a network.

The full review of the participatory work of CLACC activities is available in the December 2009 CLACC newsletter that was distributed at COP 15. It is not available on the CLACC website. The August 2009 newsletter, available on the website, reviews many of the projects, such as health and urban studies.

Relevance

Relevance: are we doing the right thing?

The extent to which the objectives of the project or programme match the needs of the target groups, the policies of the co-operation country and partner institutions, the global development goals and the client's basic development policy orientation.

CLACC started well before adaptation in climate change became a major consideration in climate discussions. So, it has grown as adaptation has evolved as a major topic. The capacity building of the CLACC fellows was well timed and completely relevant. There is also a greater realisation that there is a need to strengthen (or develop) the capacity in order to be prepared for a 'ramping up' of activity both in terms of policy development and in undertaking adaptation measures funded domestically and internationally. LDCs, amongst the most vulnerable in the world, could suffer doubly if they are not prepared. There is a need for sufficient capacity to address the issue in terms of developing and negotiating strategies, in mobilising local manpower, in developing and implementing local initiatives, in identifying where vulnerabilities are and when they will occur, in understanding all the implications of climate change in other sectors of society.

New topics mean there are new actors coming into the scene. CLACC fellows, by being early, became well positioned to provide added value. This was most evident at COP 15 in Copenhagen when their experience and knowledge proved invaluable to their delegations and others.

Objectives of CLACC:

- Strengthen the capacity of civil society in LDCs to adapt to climate change creating greater adaptive capacity among the most vulnerable groups;
- Establish an information and knowledge system catering to countries dealing with the adverse impacts of climate change; and
- Mainstream the NAPA process with key non-governmental stakeholders.

The objectives of CLACC are highly relevant. Strengthening the capacity is fundamental and this is an on-going activity. This has to be done, in large part, by an information system to help relevant organisations and individuals to be better aware of the issues and the opportunities, and to be able to mobilise resources to tackle the concerns.

It has been shown that civil society has an important role to play in this process and, thus, CLACC fills a void that is common in LDCs. Where there is a well-developed civil society it is often not oriented to climate change, and in particular adaptation.

Effectiveness

Effectiveness: are we achieving the project/programme objectives?

The extent to which the desired direct results are achieved and other direct results arise.

CLACC has evolved as a series of building blocks. Each year the tasks became more complex

As stated in the separate evaluation of IIED at COP 15, the CLACC Fellows were exceptionally motivated at COP 15. They worked closely with many of their delegations; they followed the negotiations, providing intelligence to the rest of the group and IIED staff; they were generally very open to meeting the press; they attended events that would make a difference to policies in their own country. Even though several were new Fellows, this did not hamper them as a whole from being very effective and all of them worked well together as a team.

Overall the Fellows are much more effective in developing the networks of NGOs within their own country. In some cases this is simplified because their organisations are active that way. But that is not always the case and there is often a need to start from the beginning. This was helped by the need to promote the health studies or the cities studies as well as for promoting *Tiempo*. In 2009, there was a need, as seen above, to build alliances in the lead up to COP 15.

It is illustrative to consider the lessons learned from the development of a network in Zimbabwe⁵.

- It was during the launch of the Zimbabwe Climate Change Working Group where it was realized that many CSOs [Civil Society Organisations] are embarking on climate change related programmes that are basically the same but without acknowledging what the other colleagues are doing on the same front.
- It is noted that lack of basic climate change information in institutions and communities is negatively affecting awareness raising efforts that the working group is making.
- Members need transparency for them to be supportive of the vision of the Working group and they also need feedbacks from any meeting attended by a member.
- There is need to work closely with media for them to appreciate the subject of climate Change. Otherwise they continue to see business opportunities whenever they meet with non-governmental Organisations.
- The government welcomes and are prepared to listen to civil society as long as they are organised and have clear constructive demands.

This network, facilitated by the Regional CLACC Fellow, shows what has been happening at the national level. In the same report, the Regional Fellow explained the issues that they raised when lobbying the government:

The Zimbabwe Climate Change Working Group organised a very successful meeting with one of the Directors in the Ministry of Environment and Natural Resources to lobby for the following:

1. Inclusion of Key Ministries in the Official Zimbabwe Team of Negotiators
2. Zimbabwe's position on National Climate Change Policy
3. Zimbabwe's Position on Climate Change

⁵ Report prepared by Sherpard Zvigadza

4. Zimbabwe's priority in Climate Change.
5. Adaptation Funds
6. CSO participation in the official Negotiations in Copenhagen
7. Country's Preparedness to deal with Mitigation and adaptation Project
8. Status of the Designated national Authority under Kyoto

4.4 Impact

Impact: are we contributing to the achievement of overarching development results? Extent to which the project or programme is contributing to achieving the desired overarching objectives and producing other indirect development results.

Impact has to look at its entirety and not just on the individual Fellows. The following comment from the Regional Fellow in Senegal encapsulates the impact of the fellowship in that region.

IIED is certainly an important player in Senegal and West Africa especially in the arena of the crucial issue of climate change. For instance, to the best of my knowledge, IIED is one of the rare institutions that are working to address the challenges posed by climate change on the lives and livelihoods of poor vulnerable communities in Africa. I believe that the creation of CLACC was one of the most proofs of that. Since our involvement in CLACC, we had the opportunity to conduct several case studies like "health and climate change", "cities and climate change", "economics of climate change", "community-based video", etc. and these case studies have been a good prospect of learning by doing for us and capacity building for us. All these case studies have been conducted in all CLACC countries in West Africa which are Mali, Benin, Mauritania and Senegal. The knowledge and lessons generated are shared among NGOs, researchers, decision makers and vulnerable communities themselves at national and regional levels. In addition, CLACC countries in West Africa benefited from many training sessions on what is climate change and its impacts and how to mainstream climate change adaptation into development plans. Many NGOs and NGO networks in West Africa benefited from these training sessions. With IIED support, CLACC fellows are now climate change experts in their respective countries. They are technically equipped to talk about adaptation, mitigation, technology, finance, REDD, etc. be it in relation to concrete actions to address climate change or in relation to lobbying and advocacy to support West African countries at international UNFCCC level.

In Uganda, it is a tribute to the Fellow that the monitor stated:

But it's necessary to point out that the fellow still needs to work to build the political prominence of her work by engaging contact with major development partners like DANIDA, NORAD, SIDA, DFID, the World Bank etc and key government ministries (and not necessarily only the department of meteorology) but also ministries of finance, local government and other development partners like mostly for the purpose of increasing the political profile of her work and its increasing its visibility. Lessons from the field need to be shared more actively with these partners to make the fellow's work more visible.

This is after stating that:

- The CLACC fellow organized a press conference on 25th September at the DENIVA secretariat. A statement was released for the media and a number of radio and television channels broadcasted the information.
- Materials (T-shirts and stickers) were produced and shared with at least 1000 people. Staff distributed stickers on major roads leading to the city.

- The CLACC Fellow distributed *Tiempo* magazines to participants in the National workshop and also at a climate change capacity building workshop organized by Oxfam GB and National Association for Professional Environmentalists, for CAN International, in Uganda.
- The CLACC fellow works closely with the Climate change Unit within the Ministry of Water and Environment, especially with Mr. Paul Isabirye, but is also in touch with the UNFCCC focal point, Mr. Philip Gwage. The fellow has interacted with the State Minister for Environment Hon. Jessica Eriyo.
- The CLACC Fellow attended an African Ministerial Conference on the Environment (AMCEN) that took place between the 19th and 23rd of October 2009 in Addis Ababa, Ethiopia. The Fellow participated through the Pan African Climate Justice Alliance (PACJA) where CSO across Africa met to draft a position for Africa. The fellow interacted with Uganda's delegates.

What is important about this is the growing expectations of the Fellows. That would not have been the case a year or two ago. This is but one example of the impact of the Fellows.

CLACC Fellows were required to set up a library of information on climate change that is to be made available to the public.

From Nepal

The resource centre on Climate Change established at the library of LI-BIRD has a good collection of books, reports, CDs and newsletters. The centre is being used by the professionals of LI-BIRD and some students. Materials have been added to the centre. The centre is being improved to have more facilities to attract and facilitate people to use it. Partitions boards have already arrived on site.

Overall, the impact of the CLACC Fellowship is difficult to fully assess. The true impact will not be known for a considerable time as capacity is improved, as policies evolve and as the global architecture for climate change instruments is realised. There is every indication that the Fellowship has had considerable impact. They have improved their own capacity considerably and are well positioned within the climate change community of their own countries. They are recognised and respected by governments and NGOs alike. This has to have an impact over time.

4.5 Efficiency

Efficiency: do we act cost-efficient?

A measure of the relationship between the resources invested (funds, expertise, time etc.) and the outputs and results achieved.

There were different levels of funding for the Fellows and Regional Fellows, in particular, reflecting the different work expectations. Regardless, this was a relatively small sum of money. One monitor, in Mauritania, did some calculations. He reported that the total budget for the CLACC Fellow and CLACC activities came to £10560, of which £5000 came from IIED. £2900 came from in-kind contributions from the Fellow's organisation, Tenmiya, and a further £2200 from a partnership between Tenmiya and the UN Convention to Combat Desertification. It stated that the £2200 was for non-planned activities.

There were also comments on funding from the Malawi monitor as shown below:

Limited financial resource has been one of the major challenges for the Fellow to discharge his duties as planned in 2009. The government of Malawi does not provide money to cater for

expenses for delegates from NGOs as a result the Fellow had to use money from CURE to attend such national meetings on climate change. CURE got a funding of 49,000 Euro from CORDIAD and 2,000 £ to support the 2009 activities, and CLACC provided a further 1,000 £ for supporting post COP15 activities. Basing on the 2009 plans and post COP15 activities, the money was very inadequate to undertake meaningful adaptation interventions to contribute towards the implementation of Malawi's NAPA. Also, activities under CLACC Fellow need funding as well.

There is also separate funding for Fellows for special travel, for example, to COPs or regional conferences.

The CLACC Fellows are well educated and have gained considerable experience. They provide great value to their organisations and IIED.

It is impossible to make any overall assessment. More funding would have been very beneficial, given the examples provided. Regardless, one way or another, the work was done and done well.

4.6 Sustainability

Sustainability: are outcomes and impact durable?

The probability that the desired development results of the project or programme are ensured beyond the end of assistance.

The sustainability of capacity strengthening is fundamental. It is fundamental that the LDCs develop a capacity to take a strong role in addressing and articulating their own concerns. They have to be able to mobilise the resources they have at the community level, at a national level, within governments and by civil society. This is not something that is going to be resolved quickly. Understandably, LDCs have become and are becoming more vulnerable to climate change effects, but there is a need to understand their vulnerabilities, to be able to articulate those concerns within the country and outside, and to take the initial action steps, in terms of policy development and projects. While there are expectations for significant money coming for adaptation, it has been slow to materialise. Nevertheless, LDCs need to be ready. CLACC is not into project implementation on a large scale, but it has to be part of the process to build the range of capacities needed to deal with the real adaptation concerns.

CLACC is not a short-term initiative. Regardless what happens to it as a discrete programme of IIED in the future, CLACC is based on providing a sustainable foundation, for the organisations involved and for the countries involved. Awareness creation and real capacity building in the countries are essential. CLACC Fellows are amongst the vanguard of adaptation policy development and capacity building. They are to be centres of knowledge and they have done that. It has been effective. Interestingly, the individual organisations have become much more involved than at the beginning. This has made the transition to new CLACC Fellows in many of the countries much easier. Generally, the handover has worked well.

From Nepal

LI-BIRD has been able to increase and enhance the activities and capacity building of the NGOs, Civil societies and general farmers in the grass-root level. The NGOs in the network with the support of LI-BIRD are also found to increase their activities with emphasis on Climate Change. More professionals have been involved from LI-BIRD in the CLACC activities. The CLACC Fellow is being supported by two other officers namely Mr. Prakash Limbu and Mr. Keshav Thapa. Mr. Pushpa Raj Tiwari also mentioned about use of GIS in the near future for adaptation to climate change. LI-BIRD is also able to obtain additional project and funding. CLACC started in 2005 in Nepal was only activity on Climate Change then. Steadily, the activities on Climate Change have been increasing and by 2009 besides CLACC activities there are other projects and activities namely Development Fund, Norway supported "Environment Movement in South (EMIS)", Vulnerability Assessment, Home Garden and Participatory Plant Breeding, and NAPA Transect Appraisal Exercise being added.

Monitor in Nepal

Some indication of sustainability is the involvement of former CLACC fellows, both in the CLACC programme itself and in climate change. Inevitably people will change organisations and this has happened with CLACC. Over the years there has been a big turnover. All regional Fellows have changed. In the case of Kenya, they have changed several times. There are only a few Fellows who have been there since the beginning (Benin, Bhutan and Zambia).

Many former Fellows have continued working in the field of climate change. They found their experience at CLACC to be significantly important. For the few employers who responded, they noticed the affect that CLACC had and were most supportive.

The turnover of CLACC Fellows has brought about a new category of alumni. These are former fellows who want to stay in regular contact with CLACC, even though they have changed jobs. Saleemul Huq wrote to a former fellow expressing what it could take to stay an alumnus. He stated they could:

- Stay on the CLACC mailing list (send us your new e-mail and we will put it on the CLACC mailing list)
- Continue to have access to the (closed) CLACC website.
- Stay in touch with messages for the CLACC newsletter.
- Look for opportunities where CLACC may play a role in your new job.
- If you are interested, we can from time to time ask you for specific writing assignments (as we did in the past) which you could do in your personal capacity
- Remain an ambassador for CLACC
- Attend CLACC meetings (wherever possible)
- Come to regional CLACC meetings

Their on-going interest in CLACC, climate change and adaptation is an important aspect of sustainability. No one is going to check to see if they follow the requirements stated by Saleem. As much as possible, it appears they do. Several participated in many of the events at COP 15 and were around for briefings and discussions.

The sustainability of CLACC is in the foundation it creates in the countries involved for climate change and adaptation. The foundation includes a library that Fellows created. But, over time, the library will most likely be superseded by other libraries as more and more organisations expand their own operations.

The sustainability will be realised through the development of networks of NGOs both national and community based. All Fellows were very active in 2009 developing and working with networks in their countries, as they prepared for the lead up to COP 15. This momentum needs to carry on in the future.

Many of the organisations are well placed within their countries, and even better placed now. This has to be positive.

Overall, the sustainability of CLACC objectives and actions appears very positive.

6. CLACC Beyond 2009

The annual CLACC meeting at COP 15 focused on the future of CLACC. The future is not clear and there is a need for funding to keep the work continuing as a network.

Many of the Fellows and their organisations have been seeking funding from other sources to continue their work. The abovementioned box on Nepal explains this is the case there and this is happening elsewhere as well.

The networking has a momentum that is important. The recently held Community-based Adaptation Conference in Tanzania allowed many of the Fellows to come together again in a large international forum. It is important for them to work beyond their national boundaries.

Some CLACC Fellows are continuing to work on CBAA, the economics of adaptation and urban issues. In part, it depends on their interest and their needs. IIED researchers have been very positive about the role of CLACC Fellows and are looking forward to continuing collaboration.

There are core areas such as the library that will continue to grow and this is important. If nothing else, it becomes a centre of excellence for civil society and for researchers alike. It is difficult to maintain and expand, but it is important to do so.

7. Conclusions and Recommendations

The Fellows were under the guidance of Saleemul Huq for much of the past three years. He was their mentor and inspirational leader. Even though he is no longer head of the Climate Change Group, he still has considerable influence over them as was seen at COP 15. He was continually tasking them at the daily briefings in Copenhagen and he was continually working with them, advising them, supporting them. And they responded positively to his leadership. Times move on and so does IIED as well as CLACC.

The field of adaptation is evolving. Compared to the beginnings of CLACC, adaptation is central to the climate change discussions and negotiations regardless of the outcome. More work still needs to be done. There is a need for more research, both technical and policy related; more awareness is needed to mobilise more potential stakeholders; more capacity building is necessary. CLACC has shown in a few years what some rigour and structure can do to make civil society be more assertive and taken seriously. Civil society in CLACC countries is better mobilised. CLACC has given the Fellows the tools and confidence to move forward and be central to the discussions within their countries and regions. Essentially, they are in much better control of their destiny than before. They can go to the other stakeholders or to potential funders with a good understanding of the solutions relevant to them and

with the confidence that they can deliver. They do not know everything but they are in partnership to learn in tandem with others. This would not have happened without CLACC and the support of the CCG team of IIED.

At COP 15 and throughout 2009, CLACC Fellows showed that they were capable of providing leadership to civil society within their own countries and good advice and insight to their delegations. They have a stature within their community that would not have happened without CLACC.

There was concern a couple of years ago that not all their organisations were as convinced about CLACC as the Fellows were. This is not the case now. CLACC has not only been positive to the individual Fellows but to their organisations as well. Their organisations are also better placed within the climate change community of their countries. And this is important in the lead up to COP 16, since CLACC Fellows must play a key role in mobilising support for adaptation within their countries and regions.

The following are the recommendations for CLACC:

- Networking, nationally, regionally and globally, is key to the strength of CLACC. The activities that were implemented in 2009 are continuing to expand in 2010. The networking needs to continue and monitored for effectiveness
- Every effort needs to be made to ensure that the individual components of CLACC are sustainable
- While projects, such as health or urban studies, are complete, effort needs to be made to continue to increase awareness of these issues to a wider range of stakeholders
- CLACC Fellows need to continue to work together, formally and informally. Regional Fellows already started that process but it needs to continue and expand. One of the strong points of CLACC is its teamwork.
- Efforts need to be made to update the website and continue the newsletter. Both are very valuable for reaching target audiences
- IIED needs to remain committed to working with CLACC Fellows and continuing the capacity building process
- Efforts need to be made by IIED and the Fellows themselves to continue to participate in climate change conferences
- CLACC Fellows need to continue to build contacts with the media in order to expand the coverage of adaptation and climate change issues in their countries
- CLACC needs to continue as a “brand” because it has developed a “cache” that has proven invaluable
- CLACC Fellows need to continue to be involved in research projects in order to maintain their credibility and reputation

Annex 1

The 2009 CLACC Team

Golam Rabbani (regional)	BCAS	Bangladesh	golam.rabbani@bcas.net
Elvin Nyukuri (regional)	ACTS	Kenya	e.nyukuri@acts.or.ke
Mamouda Moussa Na Abou (regional)	ENDA	Senegal	mamoudam@gmail.com
Sherpard Zvigadza (regional)	ZERO	Zimbabwe	Shepard@zeroregional.com
Silene Bila	GED	Mozambique	silenebila@gmail.com
Khumbo Kamanga	CURE	Malawi	kjkamanga@yahoo.com
George Kasali	EECZ	Zambia	eecz2002@yahoo.com
Euster Kibona	EPMS	Tanzania	eusterkibona@yahoo.com
Susan Nanduddu	DENIVA	Uganda	nanduddu@yahoo.co.uk
Sumaya Zakieldeem	SECS	Sudan	zakieldeem@yahoo.com
Dr. Anwara Begum Shelly	Caritas Bangladesh	Bangladesh	sjmmrahman@yahoo.com
Apar Paudyal	LI-BIRD	Nepal	apaudyal@libird.org
Dago Tshering	RSPN	Bhutan	dtshering@rspnbhutan.org
Mahamadou Farka Maiga	AMADE- PELCODE	Mali	mahamadoufarka1@yahoo.fr
Krystel Dossou	OFEDI	Benin	Krystod7@yahoo.fr
Madyoury Tandia	TENMIYA	Mauritania	madyourytandia@yahoo.fr
International Team			
Richard Klein	SEI	Sweden	richard.klein@sei.se
Saleemul Huq	IIED	UK	saleemul.huq@iied.org
Hannah Reid	IIED	UK	Hannah.reid@iied.org
Beth Henriette	IIED	UK	beth.henriette@iied.org
Sari Kovats	LSHTM	UK	sari.kovats@lshtm.ac.uk
Tom Downing	IIED	UK	tom.downing@sei.se

Annex 2

Calendar of Events in December during the COP 15 and CCG Participation

Event	Date	Venue	Attendance (CCG team)
ECBI Training workshop for LDC negotiators	3 rd	Hotel Cabinn Metro	Saleem, Achala, Hohit,
ECBI dinner for Senior negotiators	3 rd	TBC	Saleem, Achala
ECBI/IIED dinner with “junior” negotiators and CLACC fellows	10 th	TBC	Saleem, Simon, Ced, Hannah, Nanki, Achala, Hohit, Beth
Development and Climate days + Film Festival	11 th -14 th	D R Byen, Copenhagen	Saleem, Simon, Ced, Hannah, Nanki, Hohit, Beth, Achala, Muyeye
CLACC meeting	15 th	Hotel Cabinn Metro	Saleem, Simon, Ced, Hannah, Nanki, Achala, Hohit, Beth,
Briefing Meetings with African Academics (sponsored by SOROS)	TBC	Vartov Building	Hannah, Saleem, Terry, Hohit
Briefing Meetings with African NGO members (Sponsored by Comic Relief)	9 th	IIED exhibit at COP	Hannah, Saleem
Climate Change Media Partnership	Throughout COP	Closed meetings	Mike